



Article

Comparative Analysis of Efficiency and Environmental Impact of Various Marine Oil Cleanup Technologies

Zhigang Zhang*, Hongdong Sun

China Offshore Environmental Services (Tianjin) Co., Ltd., Tianjin, China

Abstract: Marine oil pollution, stemming from human activities, poses severe threats to ecosystems and coastal areas globally. This study assesses and compares various marine oil cleanup technologies, examining their efficiency and environmental impacts. The overview covers mechanical methods (e.g., skimming, barriers) and chemical/biological approaches (e.g., bioremediation, chemical agents). Evaluation criteria include effectiveness in diverse environments, cleanup speed, scalability, and cost/resource requirements. Case studies like the Dalian Port 7·16 Oil Leak and the Bohai Bay Oil Spill shed light on applied technologies and their outcomes. Recommendations emphasize enhancing cleanup strategies and regulatory frameworks for efficient responses to oil spill events. This study advocates for understanding cleanup technology limitations and ecological impacts while promoting sustainable strategies to combat marine oil pollution's adverse effects.

Keywords: Marine Oil Pollution; Cleanup Technologies; Environmental Impacts; Efficiency Comparison; Sustainability Strategies

1. Introduction

Marine environments worldwide face escalating threats from human-induced marine oil pollution, primarily originating from diverse activities such as shipping, industrial operations, and oil extraction [1]. These activities often result in inadvertent oil spills, posing significant hazards to aquatic ecosystems, coastal regions, and biodiversity. The discharge of oil into marine environments disrupts the delicate balance of these ecosystems, presenting immediate and long-term challenges. [2-5]

The repercussions of marine oil pollution reverberate globally, eliciting concerns due to their far-reaching environmental consequences. Such incidents garner profound attention due to their detrimental effects on marine life, ecosystems, and the socio-economic stability of communities reliant on coastal resources. The degradation of water quality, contamination of

sediments, and adverse impacts on flora and fauna are among the critical concerns stemming from these spills.[6]

Understanding the gravity of marine oil pollution is crucial for recognizing its multifaceted impact on marine habitats and ecosystems. The persistent presence of oil spills, whether caused by accidents or operational mishaps, disrupts the delicate balance of marine habitats, leading to severe and often long-lasting consequences. It is within this context that this study endeavors to comprehensively evaluate and compare various marine oil cleanup technologies, emphasizing their efficiency and environmental impacts [7].

By analyzing a broad spectrum of cleanup methodologies, this research aims to provide critical insights into the strengths, limitations, and ecological implications of these technologies [8]. Moreover, this study seeks to underscore the pressing need for sustainable and effective strategies to mitigate and alleviate the adverse effects of oil spills on marine environments [9,10]. Through comprehensive assessments and analyses, this research endeavors to contribute to the discourse on combating marine oil pollution and fostering the development of more resilient and environmentally sound cleanup strategies.

2. Overview of Marine Oil Cleanup Technologies

Marine oil cleanup technologies encompass a spectrum of methodologies designed to mitigate the adverse effects of oil spills on marine ecosystems. These techniques are categorized into mechanical, chemical, and biological methods, each offering unique approaches to containment, removal, and degradation of spilled oil [12].

2.1 Mechanical Methods

Mechanical methods constitute frontline approaches in oil spill cleanup, primarily aiming to physically contain and remove spilled oil from the water's surface. These methods include:

(1) **Skimming:** Skimming involves the use of specialized equipment, like oil skimmers, to swiftly and efficiently remove floating oil from the water's surface. These devices, ranging from drum skimmers to weir skimmers, collect the oil, which is then separated from the water. Additionally, sorbent materials, including absorbent pads or booms made of materials like polypropylene, complement skimming by adsorbing and containing oil on the water surface, aiding in its removal.

(2) **Booms and Barriers:** Booms and barriers act as physical obstacles strategically deployed to corral and confine oil spills, preventing their spread across water bodies. These containment structures are strategically positioned to limit the movement of oil, allowing for more straightforward recovery and cleanup operations. By restricting the spread of oil, booms and barriers facilitate more targeted removal efforts.

(3) **Dispersants:** Dispersants represent chemical agents applied to oil slicks to facilitate the breakup of oil into smaller droplets. This process enhances the oil's dispersion within the water column, reducing its concentration on the water's surface. Dispersants aim to accelerate the natural biodegradation of oil by microorganisms, making it less likely to reach shorelines and minimizing its impact on surface-dwelling wildlife.

2.2 Chemical and Biological Methods

Chemical and biological methods focus on altering the chemical properties of spilled oil or utilizing biological agents to enhance its degradation. These methods include:

(1) **Bioremediation:** Bioremediation harnesses natural biological processes to degrade oil contaminants. Microorganisms such as bacteria and fungi are employed to break down hydrocarbons in oil into less harmful substances. By leveraging the metabolic activities of these microorganisms, bioremediation promotes the natural degradation of oil in the environment, aiding in its removal and detoxification.

(2) **Chemical Agents:** Chemical agents encompass a diverse array of substances used to modify the chemical characteristics of oil spills. Surfactants, emulsifiers, and solvents are among the components used to disperse, dissolve, or modify the oil's characteristics, facilitating its breakdown or containment. These agents aim to alter the physical properties of the oil, enhancing its removal or transformation.

(3) **Thermal Treatment:** Thermal treatment methods involve applying heat to oil-contaminated areas to expedite oil removal or decomposition. Techniques such as incineration or high-temperature oxidation aim to vaporize or combust the oil, reducing its volume or eliminating it altogether. Thermal treatments expedite the cleanup process by reducing the volume of oil to be managed or by breaking down complex hydrocarbons into less harmful byproducts.

These multifaceted approaches encompass mechanical, chemical, and biological methods that play pivotal roles in combating marine oil pollution. The selection and application of these techniques often depend on the specific characteristics of the oil spill, environmental conditions, and the potential impact on marine ecosystems.

3. Efficiency Comparison of Cleanup Technologies

3.1 Evaluation Criteria

(1) Effectiveness in Different Environments

The effectiveness of oil cleanup technologies is significantly influenced by diverse environmental factors, including water currents, temperature, and the specific characteristics of the affected ecosystem. Variations in effectiveness between open oceans, coastal regions, or estuaries emphasize the need for adaptable technologies capable of addressing different environmental contexts. Understanding how cleanup methods perform under varying conditions is pivotal for determining their applicability and success rates in mitigating oil spills.

(2) Speed and Scale of Cleanup

Assessing the rapid initiation and scalability of cleanup operations is critical. Technologies capable of swift deployment and scalability to handle spills of varying magnitudes are considered advantageous. The ability to promptly contain and remove oil spills efficiently, especially during emergency response scenarios, is crucial in minimizing environmental impact.

(3) Cost and Resource Requirements

Conducting an in-depth analysis of the economic feasibility and resource demands of different cleanup approaches is imperative. This involves understanding the costs associated with equipment procurement, deployment, manpower requirements, and ongoing maintenance. Evaluating these factors is vital in determining the practicality, sustainability, and long-term viability of employing specific cleanup methodologies.

3.2 Analysis of Mechanical Methods

(1) Advantages and Limitations

Mechanical methods, encompassing skimming, booms, and barriers, excel in initial containment and recovery of spilled oil. However, they encounter challenges related to weather dependencies, difficulties in capturing dispersed oil, and navigational hindrances. Despite these limitations, their immediate response capabilities and adaptability in certain spill scenarios are commendable.

(2) Case Studies and Real-world Applications

Real-world applications and case studies of mechanical cleanup methods provide invaluable insights into their actual effectiveness. Instances of successful containment or challenges faced during practical implementations serve as pivotal references for assessing the efficacy and limitations of these methods in diverse spill scenarios.

3.3 Analysis of Chemical and Biological Methods

(1) Effectiveness in Various Oil Types

Chemical and biological methods exhibit varying efficacy based on the type and composition of the spilled oil. Their performance can differ significantly when dealing with distinct oil types, such as light crude or heavy bunker fuel. Assessing their adaptability and limitations across various oil types aids in understanding their applicability in different spill scenarios.

(2) Environmental Impact Assessment

Understanding the potential environmental consequences of employing chemical and biological cleanup methods is paramount. This assessment involves evaluating any secondary pollution or ecological disturbances caused by these techniques. Considering the potential ecological impacts is crucial for ensuring the overall environmental sustainability of oil spill cleanup operations.

4. Environmental Impacts of Cleanup Technologies

4.1 Short-term Effects

(1) Disruption of Marine Ecosystems

The implementation of cleanup technologies may result in short-term disturbances to marine ecosystems. Physical interventions, such as booms and skimming, can disrupt natural habitats, affecting marine organisms and their interactions within the ecosystem.

(2) Impact on Wildlife and Habitats

Short-term impacts often include direct effects on wildlife due to exposure to cleanup operations. Wildlife can suffer from oil exposure during handling or through inadvertent contact with cleanup equipment, leading to adverse effects on their health and habitats.

4.2 Long-term Effects

(1) Persistence of Cleanup Residues

Despite cleanup efforts, residues from some technologies can persist in the environment for an extended period. Residual chemicals or materials used in cleanup methods may pose long-term risks to marine life and ecosystems, affecting biological processes and the food chain.

(2) Ecological Recovery and Rehabilitation

The long-term recovery and rehabilitation of affected ecosystems after cleanup activities is crucial. Understanding the timeframe and effectiveness of natural recovery processes, such as natural degradation or restoration efforts, is essential for the sustainable restoration of impacted areas.

5. Case Studies and Comparative Analysis

Case Study	Incident Details	Applied Technologies	Outcomes and Impacts
1. Dalian Port 7-16 Oil Leak (2010) [13]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Occurred on July 16, 2010, in Dalian Port. - Leakage from a storage tank operated by Dalian Port LNG Company. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Deployment of oil containment booms - Utilization of oil skimmers and sorbents - Chemical dispersants application 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Significant reduction in oil spread due to containment efforts - Removal of oil using skimming and sorbent materials - Limited success with chemical dispersants; environmental impact due to their usage
2. Bohai Bay Oil Spill (2011) [14]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Incident took place in 2011 in the Bohai Bay. - Leakage from an oil well operated by CNOOC (China National Offshore Oil Corporation). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Utilization of containment booms for oil control - Application of dispersants - Manual and mechanical cleanup efforts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Partial success in controlling oil spread using containment booms - Dispersants contributed to oil breakup but raised ecological concerns - Manual and mechanical cleanup led to partial removal of surface oil

6. Regulatory Framework and Policy Recommendations

6.1. Current Regulations for Oil Cleanup Technologies

An assessment of the current regulatory framework governing oil cleanup technologies is imperative. This includes an overview of international, national, and regional regulations addressing the use, application, and limitations of various cleanup methods. Specific emphasis is placed on compliance requirements and standards set for environmental protection during cleanup operations.

6.2. Identification of Gaps and Improvement Areas

(1) Gaps in Regulations: Examination of potential gaps or inadequacies in existing regulations related to oil cleanup technologies is crucial. Identification of areas where regulatory frameworks fall short in addressing emerging technologies, adapting to evolving environmental challenges, or ensuring comprehensive protection of marine ecosystems is essential.

(2) Areas for Improvement: Highlighting areas that require improvement within regulatory frameworks helps pinpoint opportunities for enhancing policy development. Recommendations for updating or amending regulations to address identified gaps and align with best practices and technological advancements can be outlined.

6.3. Recommendations for Enhanced Cleanup Strategies

(1) Enhancing Cleanup Methodologies: Proposals for enhancing current cleanup methodologies involve recommending modifications or innovations to existing technologies. This includes advancements in equipment design, development of more eco-friendly materials, and the exploration of novel approaches for more effective and sustainable cleanup strategies.

(2) Community Engagement and Preparedness: Recommendations can focus on bolstering community involvement, training, and preparedness programs for rapid response to oil spill events. Enhancing coordination among stakeholders, including government bodies, industry players, and local communities, is crucial for efficient and effective cleanup operations.

7. Conclusion

Marine oil pollution, stemming from diverse anthropogenic activities, represents a substantial threat to the delicate balance of marine ecosystems and coastal regions worldwide. Incidents like the Dalian Port 7·16 Oil Leak in 2010 and the Bohai Bay Oil Spill in 2011 stand as testaments to the adverse environmental impacts of oil spills, affecting marine life, habitats, and coastal communities. Despite advancements in cleanup technologies, these incidents highlighted the complexities and limitations of various methods employed to mitigate oil spill damages.

The assessment and comparative analysis of cleanup technologies showcased a spectrum of approaches used in response to oil spill events. Mechanical methods, including skimming, deployment of containment booms, and chemical dispersants, exhibited effectiveness in initial containment and removal of surface oil. However, these methods faced challenges, such as limited success in the case of chemical dispersants, raising environmental concerns due to their usage.

Chemical and biological methods, notably bioremediation and the application of chemical agents, showed promise in promoting natural degradation and altering the chemical properties of oil spills. Nevertheless, the effectiveness of these methods varied concerning the type and composition of the spilled oil, with concerns raised about potential ecological impacts and residual effects on marine ecosystems.

The evaluation criteria for cleanup technologies encompassed their effectiveness in different environments, the speed and scalability of cleanup, and the cost-resource balance, highlighting the importance of adaptable, swift, and economically viable cleanup strategies. The short-term disruptions to marine ecosystems and the potential persistence of cleanup residues post-operations underscored the necessity for a comprehensive understanding of both immediate and long-term environmental impacts.

Additionally, real-world case studies, including the Dalian Port 7·16 Oil Leak and the Bohai Bay Oil Spill, offered insights into applied technologies and their outcomes. These incidents exemplified successes, such as containment efforts limiting oil spread and partial removal of surface oil through mechanical and manual cleanup. However, limitations and ecological concerns regarding the application of certain technologies were evident, indicating the need for further research and improved methodologies.

Moving forward, regulatory frameworks governing oil cleanup technologies require thorough examination and potential revisions to address gaps and inadequacies. Recommendations for enhancing cleanup strategies emphasize advancements in methodologies, community engagement, and preparedness for efficient responses to oil spill events. Implementing sustainable and effective strategies while acknowledging the limitations and potential environmental impacts of cleanup technologies is pivotal in safeguarding marine ecosystems and coastal regions from the adverse effects of oil pollution.

Acknowledgments: This section is required for all papers. Here you can acknowledge any support given which is not covered by the author contribution or funding sections. This may include administrative and technical support, or donations in kind (e.g., materials used for experiments). Please do not thank the editors in this section, but you can send an email to express thanks.

Funding: This section is required for all papers. Please add: “This research received no external funding.” or “This research was funded by Name of Funder, grant number XXX.”

Conflict of interest: The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

References:

1. Doerffer, J. W. (2013). Oil spill response in the marine environment. Elsevier.
2. Etkin, D. S., & Nedwed, T. J. (2021). Effectiveness of mechanical recovery for large offshore oil spills. *Marine Pollution Bulletin*, 163, 111848.
3. Nwuzor, I. C., Idumah, C. I., Nwanonyi, S. C., & Ezeani, O. E. (2021). Emerging trends

- in self-polishing anti-fouling coatings for marine environment. *Safety in Extreme Environments*, 3, 9-25.
4. Magris, R. A., & Giarrizzo, T. (2020). Mysterious oil spill in the Atlantic Ocean threatens marine biodiversity and local people in Brazil. *Marine pollution bulletin*, 153, 110961.
 5. Dhaka, A., & Chattopadhyay, P. (2021). A review on physical remediation techniques for treatment of marine oil spills. *Journal of Environmental Management*, 288, 112428.
 6. Bilal, M., Aamir, M., Abdullah, S., & Khan, F. (2023). Impacts of crude oil market on global economy: Evidence from the Ukraine-Russia conflict via fuzzy models. *Heliyon*.
 7. Liu, Z., Han, Z., Chen, Q., Shi, X., Ma, Q., Cai, B., & Liu, Y. (2023). Risk assessment of marine oil spills using dynamic Bayesian network analyses. *Environmental pollution*, 317, 120716.
 8. Pokazeev, K., Sovga, E., Chaplina, T., Pokazeev, K., Sovga, E., & Chaplina, T. (2021). Current Problems of the World Ocean Pollution by Oil and Oil Products. *Pollution in the Black Sea: Observations about the Ocean's Pollution*, 29-36.
 9. Govindarajan, S. K., Mishra, A., & Kumar, A. (2021). Oil Spill in a Marine Environment: Requirements Following an Offshore Oil Spill. *Rudarsko-geološko-naftni zbornik*, 36(4).
 10. Govindarajan, S. K., Mishra, A., & Kumar, A. (2021). Oil Spill in a Marine Environment: Requirements Following an Offshore Oil Spill. *Rudarsko-geološko-naftni zbornik*, 36(4).
 11. Kukkar, D., Rani, A., Kumar, V., Younis, S. A., Zhang, M., Lee, S. S., ... & Kim, K. H. (2020). Recent advances in carbon nanotube sponge-based sorption technologies for mitigation of marine oil spills. *Journal of colloid and interface science*, 570, 411-422.
 12. Okeke, E. S., Okoye, C. O., Ezeorba, T. P. C., et al. (2022). Emerging bio-dispersant and bioremediation technologies as environmentally friendly management responses toward marine oil spill: A comprehensive review. *Journal of Environmental Management*, 322, 116123.
 13. Wang, M., & Wang, C. (2022). Chemometric techniques in oil spill identification: A case study in Dalian 7.16 oil spill accident of China. *Marine Environmental Research*, 182, 105799.
 14. Wang, Y., Lee, K., Liu, D., Guo, J., Han, Q., Liu, X., & Zhang, J. (2020). Environmental impact and recovery of the Bohai Sea following the 2011 oil spill. *Environmental Pollution*, 263, 114343.]